

JOE NEGRON
President of the Senate



RICHARD CORCORAN
Speaker of the House



TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

**Joint Legislative Auditing Committee
December 2017**

This page intentionally left blank

Joint Legislative Auditing Committee

Representative Jennifer Sullivan, Chair
Senator Debbie Mayfield, Vice Chair

Senator Dennis Baxley
Senator Audrey Gibson
Senator Kathleen Passidomo
Senator Perry Thurston

Representative Tracie Davis
Representative Randy Fine
Representative Joe Gruters
Representative Roy Hardemon
Representative Cyndi Stevenson

This page intentionally left blank

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

SCOPE

As required by s. 215.985(7), F.S., this report from the Joint Legislative Auditing Committee (Committee) provides recommendations related the possible expansion of the Transparency Florida website,¹ including whether to expand the scope to include educational, local governmental, and other non-state governmental entities. Also, as required by s. 215.985(13), F.S., this report provides the progress made in establishing the single website required by the Transparency Florida Act and recommendations for enhancing the content and format of the website and related policies and procedures.

BACKGROUND

Overview of the Transparency Florida Act

The “Transparency Florida Act (Act),”² an act relating to transparency in government spending, requires several websites for public access to government entity financial information.

The Act, as originally approved in 2009,³ required a single website to be established by the Executive Office of the Governor (EOG), in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives. Specified information relating to state expenditures, appropriations, spending authority, and employee positions and pay rates was required to be provided on the website.

Responsibilities assigned by law to the Committee included:

- oversight and management of the website;⁴
- propose additional state fiscal information to be included on the website;
- develop a schedule for adding information from other governmental entities to the website;⁵
- coordinate with the Financial Management Information Board in developing any recommendations for including information on the website which is necessary to meet the requirements of s. 215.91(8); and,
- prepare an annual report detailing progress in establishing the website and providing recommendations for enhancement of the content and format of the website and related policies and procedures.

In 2011, the Act was revised to require the Chief Financial Officer (CFO) to provide public access to a state contract management system that provides information and documentation relating to the contracting agency.⁶ Other revisions included: (1) requiring the State’s five water management districts to provide monthly financial statements to their board members and to make such statements available for public access on their website, (2) exempting municipalities and special districts with total annual revenues of less than \$10 million from the Act’s requirements, and (3) several technical and clarifying changes.⁷ Also, a

¹ Refers to the website established by the Executive Office of the Governor, in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives, which provides information related to the approved operating budget for the State of Florida.

² Chapter 2013-54, L.O.F.

³ Chapter 2009-74, L.O.F.

⁴ Section 11.40(4)(b), F.S. (2009)

⁵ These entities included any state, county, municipal, special district, or other political subdivision whether executive, judicial or legislative, including, but not limited, to any department, division, bureau, commission, authority, district, or agency thereof, or any public school district, community college, state university, or associated board.

⁶ Chapter 2011-49, L.O.F.

⁷ *Id.*

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

revision to s. 11.40, F.S., removed the Committee's responsibility to manage and oversee the Transparency Florida website.⁸

Further revisions to the Act were adopted in 2013.⁹ In addition to the two websites previously required, the Act now also requires the following websites:

- The EOG, in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives, is required to establish and maintain a website that provides information relating to fiscal planning for the State. Minimum requirements include the Legislative Budget Commission's long-range financial outlook; instructions provided to state agencies relating to legislative budget requests; capital improvements plans, long-range program plans and legislative budget requests (LBR) submitted by each state agency or branch of state government; any amendments to LBRs; and, the Governor's budget recommendation submitted pursuant to s. 216.163, F.S.
- The Department of Management Services is required to establish and maintain a website that provides current information relating to each employee or officer of a state agency, a state university, or the State Board of Administration. Minimum requirements include providing the names of employees and their salary or hourly rate of pay; position number, class code, and class title; and employing agency and budget entity.
- The EOG, in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives, is required to establish and maintain a single website that provides access to all other websites (four) required by the Act.

Additional revisions include:

- The minimum requirements for the Act's original website (information relating to state expenditures, appropriations, spending authority, and employee positions) were expanded to include balance reports for trust funds and general revenue; fixed capital outlay project data; a 10-year history of appropriations by agency; links to state audits or reports related to the expenditure and dispersal of state funds; and links to program or activity descriptions for which funds may be expended.
- The Committee is no longer required to recommend a format for collecting and displaying information from governmental entities, including local governmental and educational entities. Rather, the Committee is required to recommend: (1) whether additional information from these entities should be included on the website, and (2) a schedule and a format for collecting and displaying the additional information.
- Language related to the contract tracking system required to be posted by the CFO is expanded to: (1) provide timelines, (2) require each state entity to post information to the contract tracking system, (3) address confidentiality and other legal issues, (4) provide definitions, and (5) authorize Cabinet members to post the required contract tracking information to their own agency-managed websites in lieu of posting on the CFO's tracking system.

No revisions to the Act have been made since 2013. Additional details relating to the Act in its current form may be found in Appendix A.

⁸ Chapter 2011-34, L.O.F.

⁹ Chapter 2013-54, L.O.F.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Previous Committee Effort

The Committee has issued four previous reports related to the Act. A brief summary of the recommendations of each report follows.

2010 Committee Report

The act, as originally written, required the Committee to develop a plan to add fiscal information for other governmental entities, such as municipalities and school districts, to the website. Although the Committee was authorized to also make recommendations related to state agency information, much of that information was specified in statute and was being implemented by the EOG, in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives. The Committee's initial focus was on school districts due to the consistency of financial information required of the State's 67 school districts. Specific recommendations and timeframes for adding school district fiscal information to *Transparency Florida*¹⁰ were provided. Also, general recommendations were provided for adding fiscal information for other governmental entities, including state agencies, universities, colleges, counties, municipalities, special districts, and charter schools/charter technical career centers.

The Committee recommended the use of three phases for the addition of school district financial information to *Transparency Florida*. The Committee wanted citizens who visit either the home page of a school district's website or *Transparency Florida* to have the ability to easily access the school district's financial information that was located on the school district's website, the Department of Education's (DOE) website, and *Transparency Florida*.

The overall approach was to recommend that information which was readily available, with minimal effort and cost, to be included for school districts during the first phases of implementation. Most of the information should be located on the DOE's website with links to access it on *Transparency Florida*. This information included numerous reports prepared by the school districts, the DOE, and the Auditor General. The Committee expected that the first two phases could be accomplished without the need for additional resources.

Ultimately, once all phases were implemented, the goal was to provide transaction-level details of expenditures. Stakeholders expressed concern about the school districts' ability to provide this level of detail. School districts' accounting systems have the ability to capture expenditures at the sub-function and the sub-object levels.¹¹ These systems do not usually capture details of the amount spent on specific supplies, such as pencils or paper, or on a roofing project. Stakeholders also had concerns about the school districts' ability to provide this information on their websites, primarily due to cost and staffing issues. Their preference was for the State to build a data-system and require the school districts to upload via FTP (File Transfer Protocol) a monthly summary of expenditures at the sub-function and sub-object levels to *Transparency Florida*. Although Committee members were interested in more detailed information, this approach was agreed to with the idea that it was a starting point. In addition, the Committee recommended that the school districts provide vendor histories, to include details of expenditures for each vendor.

Although both the State and the school districts would incur costs, the main financial burden of the project would fall on the State. Rough estimates of the State's cost ran into the millions of dollars. Due to the

¹⁰ For the purpose of this report, *Transparency Florida* refers to www.transparencyflorida.gov/, the original website created pursuant to the Transparency Florida Act.

¹¹ For example, sub-function categories include costs associated with K-12, food services, and pupil transportation services; sub-object categories include costs associated with classroom teachers, travel, and textbooks.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

uncertainty of the cost estimates, the Committee members voted to recommend to delay this phase until further information is available.

2011 Committee Report

The initial Committee report, discussed above, recommended deferring implementation related to detailed school district financial transactions until the Committee had additional information and could further discuss the issues and potential costs involved. The premise was that the school districts would transmit monthly data to the State for display on *Transparency Florida*. As explained, the cost was expected to be in the millions of dollars, but only a rough estimate was available.

In light of the continued financial difficulties being faced by the State, the Committee decided to abandon this approach and recommend an alternative. The new focus was to keep local information at the local level and for the State to provide access to it on *Transparency Florida*.

Although the Committee understood that the goal of the project was to provide more financial transparency at all levels of government, it recognized that local governments¹² know best what information their citizens want available for review. The Committee did not believe that it was the State's responsibility to design and build a system to collect and display local governments' information. Rather, the Committee recommended that the State work in partnership with local governments, as they increase transparency on their websites, so that the full financial burden did not fall on the local governments.

The Committee recommended that representatives for each type of entity develop suggested guidelines for the type of financial information and the level of detail that should be included. Each local government should be responsible for providing its financial information on its own website. A link should be included on *Transparency Florida* for each entity that implements the suggested guidelines in order to provide a central access point.

The Committee suggested that the guidelines include a uniform framework to display the information in a well-organized fashion so as to provide easy, consistent access to all online financial information for all local governments. When developing the suggested guidelines, some of the financial information that the Committee recommended for consideration included a searchable electronic checkbook, plus various documents that are prepared during the normal course of business, such as budget documents, monthly financial statements, audit reports, and contracts and related information. The Committee's intent was to provide an opportunity for increased financial transparency for Florida's citizens, by providing guidance and flexibility to local governments, without causing a financial burden in the process.

2014 Committee Report

The Committee was presented with a draft of the report which included an update for the status of *Transparency Florida* and the related websites, but did not include any recommendations. Rather, the section of the report titled "Recommendations" included only the wording "To Be Determined." A separate handout was provided in the meeting packet which included: (1) recommendations that had been suggested by Committee members, (2) a series of questions intended to guide the members during their discussion of possible recommendations, and (3) a chart which listed various types of financial-related information that could potentially be considered in an expansion of the Transparency Florida website. Specifically, this information was related to non-State entities, such as school districts, municipalities and other local entities, and included items such as budget documents, monthly financial statements, and contract information.

¹² Local government in this context referred to all non-state entities subject to the requirements of the Transparency Florida Act at the time of the Committee's recommendation.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee approved a motion to adopt the draft report “as is” by a vote of 10-1. This meant that the recommendations remained “To Be Determined” and no new information would be recommended for addition to *Transparency Florida* or the related websites. The member who voted against the motion did so because he had submitted a recommendation related to the online posting of college employee salaries that he had not had an opportunity to discuss prior to the time the motion was offered. At a subsequent meeting, the Committee adopted a related recommendation; however, because the report had already been approved, it was not available to be revised. Therefore, the recommendation was included in the cover letter which accompanied the report. The cover letter stated “[o]n February 17, 2014, the Committee recommended that the Florida Has a Right to Know website include the salary of each State University and Florida College System institution employee by position number only. The name of the employee should not be attached to the salary. Currently, the website provides the name and salary of each State University employee, in compliance with s. 215.985(6), F.S. The salaries of Florida College System institution employees are neither provided on the website, nor are they required to be provided under the provisions of the Transparency Florida Act (s. 215.985, F.S.)”

2015 Committee Report

The Committee’s only recommendation was identical to the recommendation included in the cover letter for the 2014 report. The Committee recommended that the Florida Has a Right to Know website include the salary of each State University and Florida College System institution employee by position number only. The name of the employee should not be attached to the salary. As mentioned in the previous paragraph, the website provides the name and salary of each State University employee. No information is provided on the website for Florida College System institution employees.

Transparency-Related Legislation

During the 2010 Legislative Session, the Legislature adopted proviso language to implement the Committee’s recommendations related to school districts for the first two phases. The DOE was required to provide access to existing school district financial-related reports on its website, create a working group to develop recommendations to provide school-level data in greater detail and frequency, and publish a report of its findings by December 1, 2010. School districts were required to provide a link to *Transparency Florida* on their website. Links to the DOE and other website information were provided on *Transparency Florida*. The requirements assigned to the DOE and school districts were fulfilled.

In 2011, two bills were passed which, although not directly related to the Act, related to efforts to provide more financial transparency to Florida’s citizens. Senate Bill 1292 (2011)¹³ required the Chief Financial Officer to conduct workshops with state agencies, local governments, and educational entities and develop recommendations for uniform charts of accounts. The final report was due in January 2014. An entity’s charts of accounts refers to the coding structure used to identify financial transactions. Most of the non-state entities are currently authorized to adopt their own charts of accounts. The school districts are the exception; the chart of accounts that they are required to use is specified by the DOE. During discussions related to determining recommendations for its first required report required by the Act, the Committee understood that the various charts of accounts used by entities across the state was an obstacle for providing financial data that could be compared from one entity to another.

¹³ Chapter 2011-44, L.O.F.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Senate Bill 224 (2011)¹⁴ required counties, municipalities, special districts, and school districts to post their tentative budgets, final budgets, and adopted budget amendments on their official websites within a specified period of time. If a municipality or special district does not have an official website, these documents are required to be posted on the official website of a county or other specified local governing authority, as applicable. Another provision required each local governmental entity to provide a link to the DFS' website to view the entity's annual financial report (AFR). The AFR presents a financial snapshot at fiscal year-end of the entity's financial condition. It includes the types of revenue received and expenditures incurred by the entity. The format and content of the AFR is prescribed by the DFS.¹⁵ See Appendix B for the specific requirements of the bill.

In 2013, a provision in House Bill 5401,¹⁶ the bill which revised the Act, created the User Experience Task Force. Its purpose was to develop and recommend a design for consolidating existing state-managed websites that provide public access to state operational and fiscal information into a single website. The task force was comprised of four members, with one member each designated by the Governor, Chief Financial Officer, President of the Senate, and Speaker of the House. The task force's work plan was required to include a review of: (1) all relevant state-managed websites, (2) options for reducing the number of websites without losing detailed data, and (3) options for linking expenditure data with related invoices and contracts. The recommendations, due March 1, 2014, were required to include: (1) a design that provides an intuitive and cohesive user experience that allows users to move easily between varied types of related data, and (2) a cost estimate for implementation of the design.¹⁷

In 2014, Senate Bill 1632¹⁸ required all independent special districts that had been created for one or more fiscal years to maintain an official website, effective October 1, 2015.¹⁹ The website is required to include information specified in s. 189.069, F.S., such as the special district's charter, contact information, description of the boundaries, budget, and audit report(s).

The Legislature did not address the recommendations made in the Committee's 2011 report, cover letter to the 2014 report, or the 2015 report. As previously mentioned, the 2014 report did not include any recommendations.

¹⁴ Chapter 2011-144, L.O.F.

¹⁵ See s. 218.32, F.S.

¹⁶ Chapter 2013-54, L.O.F.

¹⁷ The User Experience Task Force's Final Report is available online at <http://www.myfloridacfo.com/division/dis/transparencytaskforce/Documents/UETFFinalRecommendation2-26-2014Updated.pdf>. The Task Force focused on eleven state-managed websites, including *Transparency Florida*, that provide state-wide financial information and recommended the following: (1) the use of www.floridasunshine.gov as a portal to access the information provided on these websites; (2) three levels of support for the portal, including a Transparency Steering Committee and the current website managers (i.e., the Governor's Office, the CFO's Office, etc.); (3) a three-pronged approach to education and training that includes a PowerPoint presentation and video of Florida's budget process; (4) categorizing the financial information provided in one of four categories: revenue, budget, spend, and audit; and (5) website features to include consistency in the display of webpages, the ability to search each website, compatibility with major web browsers, and numerous other suggestions to enhance the users' experience. The estimated cost to implement these recommendations is less than \$300,000; however the Task Force acknowledged that their recommendations are very high-level. The report stated that "[d]etailed requirements should be further developed to quantify the effort, costs, implementation schedule, and the detailed design." [p. 34]

¹⁸ Chapter 2014-22, L.O.F.

¹⁹ Dependent special districts are not required to maintain a separate website; however, their information must be accessible online from the website of the local general-purpose government that created the special district.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

PRESENT SITUATION

Status of Single Website

The requirements of s. 215.985(3), F.S., have been met. The single website titled “Florida Sunshine: Guiding you to the right financial source” provides external links to all other websites required by the Act and is available at <http://floridasunshine.gov/>. It provides access to: (1) Transparency Florida (State Finances), (2) Transparency Florida (State Budget), (3) Florida Has a Right to Know, (4) Florida Accountability Contract Tracking System (FACTS), (5) Florida Fiscal Portal, (6) Florida Government Program Summaries, and (7) Transparency Florida Act User Experience Task Force.

Status of the Website Related to the Approved Operating Budget for State Government

The requirements of s. 215.985(4), F.S., have been met. The website titled “[Transparency Florida](#)” includes detailed financial-related information for state agencies and other units of state government for the fiscal years 2008-09 through the current fiscal year, 2017-18. School district information is also available.

Summary of State Information Available on *Transparency Florida*

The main focus of *Transparency Florida* has been to provide current financial data related to the State’s operating budget and daily expenditures made by the state agencies. Such financial data is updated nightly as funds are released to the state agencies, transferred between budget categories, and used for goods and services.

In September 2015, an updated version of *Transparency Florida* was released. Effort was made to provide a simpler interface for users who may not be familiar with the state appropriations process and terminology, yet retain the depth of information for the more knowledgeable users.

The Home Page provides the following nine options for users to navigate through the website:

- General Public: Summary View of Budget and Spending by Agency;
- Budget Analyst: In-depth breakdown of Budget and Spending;
- Interactive Bill: View of Budget and Spending in Appropriations Bill format;
- State Positions: List of positions with corresponding Salaries and Benefits;
- Reports: Chart, compare, filter specific Budget and Spending data;
- Quick Facts: Summarized lists of similar Budget items;
- Search: Quickly find information on Budget and Spending items;
- Site Information: Information and help with this website; and
- Other Budget Links: Links to School Districts and other Government Budget information.

The first four options all relate to the State’s Operating Budget. By selecting the General Public option, some details of the operating budget are available in agency format. This format allows users to select a specific state agency, including the legislative branch and the state courts system, to view the fiscal year budget and the amount spent to date. The current fiscal year, 2017-18, is the default; however, users may view information for any fiscal year from 2008-09 through the current year by selecting from a drop-down menu. By clicking on the hyperlinks, users may drill down to view the operating budget and amount spent broken down by program.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Budget Analyst option allows users to select either the agency format or the ledger format. The agency format displays the appropriation amount and number of positions for the fiscal year selected, listed by agency. Users may drill down to the program or service area by selecting an agency's hyperlink. Additional details, including disbursements by object and an organizational schedule of allotment balances, are provided by continuing to select hyperlinks.

The ledger format displays appropriations-related information over the course of the fiscal year. It begins with the General Appropriations Act (GAA) and includes additional entries for Supplemental Appropriations, Vetoes, Budget Amendments approved by the Legislative Budget Commission, and other actions that effect the GAA. Users can select hyperlinks to obtain additional information for each item.

The Interactive Bill format displays the initial information as it appears in the General Appropriations Act. Again, users may drill down to view more detailed information by clicking on the hyperlinks. As the user drills down, the screen displays the information described above for the Budget Analyst option. By continuing to drill down, the name of each vendor associated with an expenditure is provided. Since the State does not have electronic invoicing, images of invoices are not provided; however, the statewide document number is provided, and users may contact the specified agency contact to request further information or a copy of an invoice.

The State Positions option provides position information by agency and by program. At the agency level, the number of fixed, excess, total, reserve, authorized, established, filled, and vacant positions may be viewed. By drilling down, which may be done by selecting the hyperlink for the program area, users may view salary for the positions by selecting the Details tab. Salaries are provided by position level only and do not include employee names.

The Budget Analyst, Interactive Bill, and State Positions options provide a new feature which allows the user to indicate whether or not he or she wishes to display the codes associated with each entry. All of the four options, including General Public, provide users with the ability to export the information into an Excel spreadsheet.

Various reports relating to the operating budget, appropriations/disbursements, fixed capital outlay, reversions, general revenue, and trust funds may be generated from *Transparency Florida* by selecting the Reports option. These reports include:

- Operating budget by expenditure type, fund source, or program area;
- Comparison of operational appropriations for two fiscal years by state agency and/or category;
- Comparison of operational appropriations to disbursements made within one fiscal year by state agency and/or category;
- Comparison of operational disbursements for two fiscal years by state agency, category, and/or object code;
- Disbursements by line item;
- Fixed capital outlay appropriations and disbursements by category and/or state agency;
- Schedule of Allotment Balances;
- Annual operational reversions by fiscal year;
- Comparison of operational reversions by fiscal year;
- Fixed capital outlay appropriations, reversions, and outstanding disbursements by fiscal year;
- Five-year history of operational reversions;
- General Revenue Fund cash balance, cash receipts, and cash disbursements, by month and by year;
- Trust fund cash and investment balance in the State Treasury for current fiscal year, for all operating trust funds and their corresponding state agency;

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- Trust fund cash balance and daily cash balance, for all operating trust funds and their corresponding state agency;
- Trust Fund Revenues Report; and,
- Ten-Year History of Appropriation Reports

The Quick Facts option provides information related to budget amendments, back of bill appropriations, budget issues, supplemental appropriations, and vetoes. A description of each of these items, the dollar amount (if applicable), and other details are provided.

By selecting the Search Option, users may search the appropriations bill, budget issues, objects, and vendors by entering a key word or phrase or similar information and continue to drill down to obtain more detailed information.

The Site Information option provides a training overview, the agency contact list, glossary, and frequently asked questions.

Finally, by selecting the Other Budget Links option, *Transparency Florida* provides links to various reports, websites, and other documents related to the state budget as follows:

- Fiscal Analysis in Brief: an annual report prepared and published by the Legislature that summarizes fiscal and budgetary information for a given fiscal year;
- Long-Range Financial Outlook 3 Year Plan: an annual report prepared and published by the Legislature that provides a longer-range picture of the State's financial position by integrating projections of the major programs driving annual budget requirements with revenue estimates;
- The Chief Financial Officer's [Transparency Florida](#): a webpage which includes links to:
 - State Financials (Budget, Spending and related information);
 - State Payments;
 - Florida State Contract Search (FACTS);
 - State Contract Audits;
 - State Economic Incentives Program;
 - Quasi Government Spending;
 - Estimated state taxes paid based on income (labeled as "Where State Dollars Go: Your Money Matters");
 - State Financial Reports;
 - State Government Information;
 - Local Government Financial Reporting;²⁰ and,
 - State Employee Data (Florida Has a Right to Know website).
- Reports on State Properties and Occupancy Rates: information from the Department of Management Services' Division of Real Estate Development and Management on state-owned buildings and occupancy rates;
- Government Program Summaries: encyclopedia of descriptive information on over 200 major state programs compiled by the Office of Program Policy Analysis and Government Accountability; and
- Reports on Public School Districts: these reports will be described in the next section of this report.

Transparency Florida includes all information required by the Act.

²⁰ Although labeled **Local Budgets** on this webpage, the information provided relates to actual revenues and expenditures, and not budgeted amounts. Most local governmental entities are required by law to post budget information on their own websites.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Background and Summary of School District Information Accessible from *Transparency Florida*

To date, the only non-state financial-related information that is accessible from *Transparency Florida* relates to school districts. As previously discussed, the Committee's focus for its 2010 report was on the addition of school district information to the website. Proviso language in the 2010 General Appropriations Act²¹ was based on the Committee's 2010 recommendations and required the DOE to:

- Coordinate, organize, and publish online all currently available reports relating to school district finances, including information generated from the DOE's school district finance database;
- Coordinate with the EOG to create links on *Transparency Florida* to school district reports by August 1, 2010;
- Publish additional finance data relating to school districts not currently available online, including school-level expenditure data, by December 31, 2010;
- Work with the school districts to ensure that each district website provides a link to *Transparency Florida*; and
- Establish a working group to study issues related to the future expansion of school finance data available to the public through *Transparency Florida*, develop recommendations regarding the establishment of a framework to provide school-level data in greater detail and frequency, and publish a report of its findings by December 1, 2010.

The DOE met the proviso language requirements and the EOG, working in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives, provided access to the related school district information on *Transparency Florida*. As a result, the following reports and other information are now accessible by selecting the Links option from the *Transparency Florida* Home Page:

- School District Summary Budget
- School District Annual Financial Report
- School District Audit Reports Prepared by the Auditor General
- School District Audit Reports Prepared by Private CPA Firms
- School District Program Cost Reports
- Financial Profiles of School Districts
- Florida Education Finance Program (FEFP) Calculations
- Five-Year Facilities Work Plan
- Public School District Websites

A description of these reports is provided in Appendix C.²²

In addition, the websites of some school districts include a link to *Transparency Florida*. The proviso language that required school districts to post the link to *Transparency Florida* on their home page was in effect for the 2010-11 fiscal year. Currently, there is no such requirement.

The DOE established the workgroup required by the proviso language to address the expansion of school district information available on *Transparency Florida*. The School District Working Group's report, published in December 2010, recommended:

²¹ Proviso language for Specific Appropriations 116 through 130 of Ch. 2010-152, L.O.F.

²² Links to school district reports on *Transparency Florida* are located at <http://transparencyflorida.gov/info/LinkInfo.aspx?FY=16>.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- Providing school-level data at the sub-function (i.e., K-12, food services, and pupil transportation services) and sub-object (i.e., classroom teachers, travel, and textbooks) levels;²³ and,
- Uploading school district data to *Transparency Florida* via file transfer protocol (FTP) on a monthly basis.

The sub-function and sub-object levels were recommended as the most cost effective method due to the variety of accounting packages used by the school districts. These report recommendations align with the Committee's 2010 recommendations for phase three of school district implementation. The goal of this phase was to provide more frequent and detailed information than had been recommended in the two earlier phases. The Committee's 2011 recommendation, however, was to require local entities, including school districts, to post their financial information on their own website. The Committee reversed the earlier recommendation which required entities to submit data to the State and the State bearing the responsibility to design and build a system to receive and display the information on *Transparency Florida*. The Committee's 2014 and 2015 recommendation was to not require the inclusion of any additional information on *Transparency Florida* from school districts or any other entity.

Status of the Website Related to Fiscal Planning for the State

The requirements of s. 215.985(5), F.S., have been met. The website titled "[Florida Fiscal Portal](#)" includes budget-related information for the fiscal years 2000-2001 through 2018-2019. Publications available include: (1) planning and budgeting instructions provided to state agencies, (2) agency legislative budget requests, (3) the Governor's recommended budget, (4) appropriations bills, (5) the approved budget, (6) the final budget report (prepared after year-end), (7) agency long-range program plans, (8) agency capital improvement plans, (9) fiscal analysis in brief, (10) long-range financial outlook 3 year plan, and other documents for selected years.

Status of the Website Related to Employee Positions and Salary

The requirements of s. 215.985(6), F.S., have been met. The website titled "[Florida Has A Right To Know.](#)" allows users to search payroll data from the State of Florida People First personnel information system. The database includes information from all Executive Branch agencies, the Lottery, the Justice Administrative Commission (including state attorneys and public defenders), and the State Courts System (including judges). In addition, spreadsheets provide information related to employees of the State Board of Administration and all 12 of the state universities.

Information available includes: (1) name of employee, (2) salary or other rate of pay,²⁴ (3) employing agency or entity, (4) budget entity, (5) position number, (6) class code, and (7) class title. The People First information is updated weekly, the university information is updated twice per year, and the State Board of Administration information is updated quarterly.

²³ The level of detail required by *Financial and Program Cost Accounting and Reporting for Florida Schools*. Known as the Red Book, this is the uniform chart of accounts required to be used by all Florida school districts for budgeting and financial reporting (see ss. 1010.01 and 1010.20, F.S., and Rule 6A-1.001, F.A.C.).

²⁴ Universities provide the amount paid per term for Other Personnel Service (OPS) employees; the remaining entities provide the hourly rate of pay for OPS employees.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Status of the Contract Management System

The requirements of s. 215.985(14), F.S., have been met. The CFO established the [Florida Accountability Contract Tracking System \(FACTS\)](#), which provides online public access to information related to contracts, grant agreements, and purchase orders executed by most state agencies. According to staff of the Department of Financial Services, the Legislature, the Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services, and the Department of Legal Affairs do not use FACTS.²⁵ Information available includes: (1) agency name, (2) vendor/grantor name, (3) type (contract, grant, or purchase order), (4) agency assigned contract ID (if applicable), (5) grant award ID (if known), (6) purchase order (PO) number (if applicable), (7) total dollar amount, (8) commodity/service type, and (9) DFS contract audits (if applicable). Users may search for contract, grant, or purchase information by agency name, dollar value, commodity/service type (for contract and purchase orders), contract ID, MyFloridaMarketPlace (MFMP) purchase order number, vendor/grantor name, beginning and/or ending dates, and/or grant award ID. By selecting a specific contract, grant, or purchase order and drilling down, users may access detailed information such as statutory authority, deliverables, a record of payments made, and an image of the contract or grant agreement. State agencies are required to redact confidential information prior to posting the contract document image online. Due, in part, to the length of time necessary to review contracts to ensure that all confidential information has been redacted, there may be a delay in posting images. For contracts in which the Department of Financial Services has conducted an audit, either summary or more detailed information is available, depending on the date of the audit.²⁶

Status of Water Management District Information

The requirements of s. 215.985(11), F.S., have been met. All five of the state's water management districts indicated that they provide monthly financial statements to their governing board members. Also, monthly financial statements are posted on the website of each water management district dating back to February 2016 or earlier.

Potential Entities Subject to Transparency Florida Act Requirements

A governmental entity, as defined in the Act, means any state, regional, county, municipal, special district, or other political subdivision whether executive, judicial, or legislative, including, but not limited to, any department, division, bureau, commission, authority, district, or agency thereof, or any public school district, community college, state university, or associated board. As originally passed, the Act required the Committee to recommend a format for displaying information from these entities on *Transparency Florida*. Smaller municipalities and special districts, defined as those with a population of 10,000 or less, were exempt from the Act. Entities that did not receive state appropriations were also exempt. Later, the Act was revised to provide an exemption based on revenues rather than population. Municipalities and special districts with total annual revenues of less than \$10 million were then exempt from the Act's requirements. In addition, the exemption for entities that did not receive state appropriations was removed.

²⁵ An exemption for these two Cabinet agencies, provided in s. 215.985(14)(i), F.S., authorizes each to create its own agency-managed website for posting contracts in lieu of posting such information on the CFO's contract management system. Both agencies, the Senate, and the House of Representatives provide contract information and documents on their respective websites. In addition, information related to Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services' contracts is on FACTS.

²⁶ By selecting the Audit tab for a specific contract, users are also provided a link to the Department of Financial Services' Transparency Florida Contract Audit page. On this webpage, a comprehensive list of contracts that have been audited from 2010-11 through 2014-15 fiscal years is provided that includes the evaluation criteria used during the audit and the number of contacts with deficiencies.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Subsequent to a major revision in 2013, current law does not require specific non-state entities to be included in the Committee’s recommendations or provide an exemption to any of these entities. The Committee is required to recommend “additional information to be added to a website, such as whether to expand the scope of the information provided to include state universities, Florida college system institutions, school districts, charter schools, charter technical career centers, local government units, and other governmental entities.”²⁷ The following table shows the number of non-state entities of each type that could potentially be recommended for inclusion:

Type of Entity (Non-State)	Total Number
School Districts	67
Charter Schools and Charter Technical Career Centers	652 ²⁸
State Universities	12
Florida College System Institutions	28
Counties	67 ²⁹
Municipalities	412
Special Districts	1687 active ³⁰
Regional Planning Councils	11
Metropolitan Planning Organizations	27
Entities affiliated with Universities and Colleges, such as the Moffitt Cancer Center	Unknown

To date, only school districts have been assigned responsibility related to the Transparency Florida Act. As previously discussed, the DOE was directed to work with the school districts to ensure that each district’s website provided a link to *Transparency Florida*. This requirement was based on proviso language and was applicable for the 2010-11 fiscal year.

RECOMMENDATION

On December 7, 2017, the Committee approved a recommendation to revise the “Transparency Florida Act,” s. 215.985(6), F.S., to add the personnel information for state college employees and officers to the required website, which is known as “Florida Has a Right to Know.”

Committee staff note: The referenced section of law requires the Department of Management Services to establish and maintain a website that provides current information relating to each employee or officer of a

²⁷ Section 215.985(7)(a), F.S.

²⁸ Reported by the Department of Education for the 2015-16 school year.

²⁹ While there are 67 counties within the State, there are many more independent reporting entities since many of the constitutional officers operate their own financial management/accounting systems. The 38 counties that responded to a 2009 survey by the Florida Association of Counties reported 193 independent reporting entities.

³⁰ Current as of October 5, 2017.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

state agency, a state university, or the State Board of Administration. At a minimum, the information must include each employees’:

- Name and hourly rate of pay;
- Position number, class code, and class title; and
- Employing agency and budget entity.

For a description of the current status of the information provided online, see Page 11, “Status of the Website Related to Employee Positions and Salary.”

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Appendix A

Requirements of the Transparency Florida Act		
Entity	Section of Law	Requirement
Joint Legislative Auditing Committee	215.985(7)	By November 1, 2013, and annually thereafter, the Committee shall recommend to the President of the Senate and the Speaker of the House of Representatives: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Additional information to be added to a website, such as whether to expand the scope of the information provided to include state universities, Florida College System institutions, school districts, charter schools, charter technical career centers, local government units, and other governmental entities. • A schedule for adding information to the website by type of information and governmental entity, including timeframes and development entity. • A format for collecting and displaying the additional information.
Joint Legislative Auditing Committee	215.985(13)	Prepare an annual report detailing progress in establishing the single website and providing recommendations for enhancement of the content and format of the website and related policies and procedures. Report shall be submitted to the Governor, the President of the Senate, and the Speaker of the House of Representatives by November 1.
Joint Legislative Auditing Committee	215.985(9)	Coordinate with the Financial Management Information Board in developing recommendations for including information on the website which is necessary to meet the requirements of s. 215.91(8) . ³¹
Executive Office of the Governor (EOG), in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives	215.985(3)	Establish and maintain a single website that provides access to all other websites required by the Transparency Florida Act. These websites include information relating to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The approved operating budget for each branch of state government and state agency; • Fiscal planning for the state; • Each employee or officer of a state agency, a state university, or the State Board of Administration; and, • A contract tracking system. Specific requirements include compliance with the American Disabilities Act, compatible with all major web browsers, provide an intuitive user experience to the extent possible, and provide a consistent visual design, interaction or navigation design and information or data presentation.
EOG, in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives	215.985(4)	Establish and maintain a website that provides information relating to the approved operating budget for each branch of state government and state agency. Information must include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Disbursement data and details of expenditure data, must be searchable; • Appropriations, including adjustments, vetoes, approved supplemental appropriations included in legislation other than the General Appropriations Act (GAA), budget amendments, and other actions and adjustments; • Status of spending authority for each appropriation in the approved operating budget, including released, unreleased, reserved, and disbursed balances. • Position and rate information for employees; • Allotments for planned expenditures and the current balance for such allotments; • Trust fund balance reports; • General revenue fund balance reports; • Fixed capital outlay project data;

³¹ The Financial Management Information Board, comprised of the Governor and Cabinet, has not met in a number of years.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Requirements of the Transparency Florida Act		
Entity	Section of Law	Requirement
EOG, in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives (Continued)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A 10-year history of appropriations by agency; and • Links to state audits or reports related to the expenditure and dispersal of state funds.
EOG, in consultation with the appropriations committees of the Senate and the House of Representatives	215.985(5)	<p>Establish and maintain a website that provides information relating to fiscal planning for the state:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The long-range fiscal outlook adopted by the Legislative Budget Commission; • Instructions to agencies relating to the legislative budget requests, capital improvement plans, and long-range program plans; • The legislative budget requests submitted by each state agency or branch of state government, including any amendments; • The capital improvement plans submitted by each state agency or branch of state government; • The long-range program plans submitted by each state agency or branch of state government; and • The Governor’s budget recommendation submitted pursuant to s. 216.163. <p>The data must be searchable by the fiscal year, agency, appropriation category, and keywords. The Office of Policy and Budget in the EOG shall ensure that all data added to the website remains accessible to the public for 10 years.</p>
Department of Management Services (DMS)	215.985(6)	<p>Establish and maintain a website that provides current information relating to each employee or officer of a state agency, a state university, or the State Board of Administration. Information to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Name and salary or hourly rate of pay of each employee; • Position number, class code, and class title; • Employing agency and budget entity. <p>Information must be searchable by state agency, state university, and the State Board of Administration, and by employee name, salary range, or class code and must be downloadable in a format that allows offline analysis.</p>
Manager of each website described in 215.985(4), (5), and (6). This refers to the three preceding websites and to staff of the EOG and DMS.	215.985(8)	Submit to the Joint Legislative Auditing Committee information relating to the cost of creating and maintaining such website, and the number of times the website has been accessed.
Chief Financial Officer (CFO)	215.985(14)	Establish and maintain a secure contract tracking system available for viewing and downloading by the public through a secure website. Appropriate Internet security measures must be used to ensure that no person has the ability to alter or modify records available on the website.
Each State Agency	215.985(14)(a) and (b)	Post contract related information on the CFO’s contract tracking system within 30 days after executing a contract. Information to include names of contracting entities, procurement method, contract beginning and ending dates, nature or type of commodities or services purchased, applicable contract unit prices and deliverables, total compensation to be paid or received, all payments made to the contractor to date, and applicable contract performance measures. If competitive solicitation was not used, justification must be provided. Information must be updated within 30 days of any contract amendments.
Water Management Districts	215.985(11)	Provide a monthly financial statement to its governing board and make such statement available for public access on its website.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Appendix B

Summary of Senate Bill 224 (2011) Requirements Related to Financial Transparency³² <i>Documents That Entities Are Required to Post on Their Official Websites</i>				
Type of Entity <i>(Current Statutory Reference)</i>	Tentative Budget <i>(must be posted online)</i>	Final Budget <i>(must be posted online)</i>	Adopted Budget Amendments <i>(must be posted online)</i>	If No Official Website
Board of County Commissioners <i>ss. 129.03(3)(c) and 129.06(2)(f)2., F.S.</i>	2 days before public hearing	Within 30 days after adoption	Within 5 days after adoption	N/A
Municipality <i>(s. 166.241(3) and (5), F.S.)</i>	2 days before public hearing	Within 30 days after adoption	Within 5 days after adoption	The municipality must, within a reasonable period of time as established by the county or counties in which the municipality is located, transmit the tentative and final budgets and any adopted amendment to the manager or administrator of such county or counties who shall post such documents on the county's website.
Special District (excludes Water Management Districts) <i>(s. 189.016(4) and (7), F.S.)</i>	2 days before public hearing and must remain on the website for at least 45 days	Within 30 days after adoption and must remain on the website for at least 2 years	Within 5 days after adoption and must remain on the website for at least 2 years	By October 1, 2015, or by the end of the first full fiscal year after its creation, each special district must maintain an official website [s. 189.069(1), F.S.].
Property Appraiser <i>(s. 195.087, F.S.)</i>	N/A	Within 30 days after adoption	N/A	If the Property Appraiser does not have an official website, the final approved budget must be posted on the county's official website
Tax Collector <i>(s. 195.087, F.S.)</i>	N/A	Within 30 days after adoption	N/A	If the Tax Collector does not have an official website, the final approved budget must be posted on the county's official website
Clerk of Circuit Court <i>(budget may be included in county budget)</i> <i>(s. 218.35, F.S.)</i>	N/A	Within 30 days after adoption	N/A	Must be posted on the county's official website
Water Management District <i>(s. 373.536(5)(d) and (6), F.S.)</i>	2 days before public hearing	Within 30 days after adoption	N/A	N/A
District School Board <i>(s. 1011.03(4) and (5), F.S.)</i>	2 days before public hearing	Within 30 days after adoption	Within 5 days after adoption	N/A
Additional Requirement				
Each local governmental entity website must provide a link to the Department of Financial Services' (DFS) website to view the entity's annual financial report (AFR) submitted; if an entity does not have an official website, the county government website must provide the link.				

³² Some language has been subsequently amended since the passage of Senate Bill 224; the current language is provided above.

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This page intentionally left blank

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Appendix C

Transparency Florida Links: Reports and Other Information Available for School Districts <i>(As recommended in the Committee's 2010 report)</i>	
Title of Report / Other Information	Summary Description of Report / Other Information
School District Summary Budget http://www.fldoe.org/finance/fl-edu-finance-program-fefp/school-dis-summary-budget.shtml	<i>At the beginning of each fiscal year, each district school board formally adopts a budget. The District Summary Budget is the adopted budget that is submitted to the Department of Education (DOE) by school districts. The budget document provides millage levies; estimated revenues detailed by federal, state, and local sources; and estimated expenditures.</i>
School District Annual Financial Report http://www.fldoe.org/finance/fl-edu-finance-program-fefp/school-dis-annual-financial-reports-af.shtml	<i>The Annual Financial Report is the unaudited data submitted to the DOE by school districts after the close of each fiscal year. It includes actual revenues detailed by federal, state, and local sources, and actual expenditures.</i>
School District Audit Reports Prepared by the Auditor General https://flauditor.gov/pages/subjects/dsb.htm	<i>The Auditor General provides periodic financial, federal, and operational audits of district school boards. The Auditor General also provides periodic audits of district school boards to determine whether the district: 1) complied with state requirements governing the determination and reporting of the number of full-time equivalent students under the Florida Education Finance Program and 2) complied with state requirements governing the determination and reporting of the number of students transported.</i>
School District Audit Reports Prepared by Private CPA Firms https://flauditor.gov/pages/dsb_efile.htm	<i>The Auditor General maintains copies of district school board financial and federal audit reports, which are prepared on a rotational basis by private certified public accounting firms.</i>
School District Program Cost Reports http://public2.fldoe.org/TransparencyReports/CostReportSelectionPage.aspx	<i>The Program Cost Report data is submitted to the DOE by school districts after the close of each fiscal year. Actual expenditures by fund type are presented as either direct costs or indirect costs, and are attributed to each program at each school. A total of nine separate reports are produced from the cost reporting system.</i>
Financial Profiles of School Districts http://www.fldoe.org/schools/k-12-public-schools/profiles-of-fl-school-diss.shtml	<i>The Financial Profiles of School Districts reports provide detailed summary information about revenues and expenditures of the school districts – revenues by source and expenditures by function and object.</i>
Florida Education Finance Program (FEFP) Calculations http://www.fldoe.org/finance/fl-edu-finance-program-fefp/fl-edu-finance-program-fefp-calculatio.shtml	<i>The FEFP is the primary mechanism for funding the operating costs of the school districts, and calculations are made five times throughout each school year to arrive at each year's final appropriation. The amount allocated to each of the components of the FEFP funding formula is shown for each school district.</i>
Five-Year Facilities Work Plan http://www.fldoe.org/finance/edual-facilities/wkplans/	<i>The 5-Year District Facilities Work Plan is the authoritative source for educational facilities information, including planning and funding. Governmental entities that use this information include the Department of Education, Legislature, Governor's Office, Division of Community Planning (growth management), and local governments.</i>
Public School Websites https://app2.fldoe.org/publicapps/Schools/schoolmap/flash/schoolmap_text.asp	<i>Provides a link to the homepage of each school district.</i>

TRANSPARENCY FLORIDA STATUS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This page intentionally left blank